

Report of the Diversity Committee on Diversity at the Austin W. Marxe School of Public and International Affairs

We at the Austin W. Marxe School of Public and International Affairs (MSPIA) are committed to hiring and retaining faculty and staff from underrepresented groups, especially African-Americans and Latinx, and women, to ensure that the faculty and staff reflect the diversity of the city we serve. We strive to foster a climate that is welcoming to our diverse student body and to all people from diverse racial, ethnic, socioeconomic, cultural, and religious backgrounds—a climate that embraces individuals across intersections of age, sex, gender, sexual orientation, ability status, and political perspectives.

We stand by the historic mission of CUNY to ensure “...equal access and opportunity for students, faculty and staff from all ethnic and racial groups and from both sexes.”¹ In the words of Governor Cuomo, “We cherish our diversity. We find strength in our differences. Whether you are gay or straight, Muslim or Christian or Jewish or Buddhist, rich or poor, black or white or Latino or Asian, man or woman, cisgender or transgender, we respect all people in the State of New York.”² In light of the increased incidents of hate speech and hate crimes that have occurred in the wake of the recent presidential election, both nationally and in New York City, this committee strongly endorses the message delivered by Governor Cuomo.

In order to assess and nurture our progress toward our collective goals, the Diversity Strategic Plan adopted by the MSPIA Faculty in May of 2015 charged the Diversity Committee with the task of writing and delivering a report that, “will include, but is not limited to, the topics of recruitment, retention, and climate. The report will summarize present conditions, recognize positive efforts, and make recommendations.”³ This is the first report written in fulfillment of this charge. It will focus on the period from the spring of 2015 to the present.

The report begins with an overview of diversity at Baruch College and then offers detailed observations concerning the recruitment, retention, and climate of MSPIA. It concludes with some recommendations.

Overview

In terms of racial diversity, the faculty at MSPIA is only slightly less diverse than the total full-time faculty of Baruch College. It is also slightly less gender-balanced than the total Baruch College faculty. But in both areas there is a long way to go to achieve the goal of reflecting the diversity of New York City, and the diversity of our students.

The most recent college-wide data on diversity are published in the Executive Order 11246 Affirmative Action Plan report for the period September 1, 2015 to August 31, 2016 prepared under the supervision of Kieran B. Morrow, Baruch’s Chief Diversity Officer, at the Office of

¹ From the CUNY “Mission and History” page: <http://www2.cuny.edu/about/history/>.

² From Andrew Cuomo’s “Letter to CUNY Students” sent 11/20/2016.

³ See the full Diversity Strategic Plan at: http://blogs.baruch.cuny.edu/diversefutures/?page_id=14

Diversity, Compliance, and Equity Initiatives (ODCEI).⁴ Although the overall percentage of the Baruch workforce comprised of African-American, Latinx, and Asian persons was 49.4,⁵ and the overall percentage of women was 46.8, workforce composition varies widely by job title. Only 27.7 percent of faculty were African-American, Latinx or Asian, the lowest percentage of any job category at Baruch. Further, only 38.6 percent were women. See **Table One** in the Appendix.

Focusing on the MSPIA faculty, according to the most recent utilization reports provided by the ODCEI in the fall of 2016, there are 36 tenured, tenure-track, or clinical faculty at the school, 22 male and 14 female. Of this group, 5 are “Asian, Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islanders,” 2 are African American, and one is Latinx. **Table Two** in the Appendix offers additional information about this group. Of the 12 faculty who hold the title Lecturer or Distinguished Lecturer, 4 are female, two are “Asian, Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islanders,” and two are African American. See **Table Three** in the Appendix for more information about this group. Taken together, the full-time faculty at MSPIA is 37.5% women and 25% minorities. Asians comprise 41.7 percent of the total minority population.

The following table compares MSPIA Faculty to Baruch total full time faculty,⁶ the total full time faculty at NASPAA-Accredited Programs,⁷ the Baruch student body,⁸ and the total population of New York City.⁹

	MSPIA Tenure Track Faculty	MSPIA Total Full Time Faculty	Baruch Total Full Time Faculty	Full Time Faculty in NASPAA Accredited Programs	Baruch Student Body	New York City Population
Male	61.1%	62.5%	61.4%	66%	50%	47.5%
Female	38.9%	37.5%	38.8%	34%	50%	52.5%
White	77.8%	75%	72.3%	77%	37.6%	34%
Minority ¹⁰	22.2%	25%	27.7%	23%	62.4%	66%

⁴ The full report may be viewed at: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/0B5bJsJt8H0m1WUfC0x4Vms2eGc/view>

⁵ In this report, the category “minority” “includes persons of two or more races and is further sub-divided into (i) Asian/Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander (‘Asian’), (ii) Black or African American (‘Black’), and (iii) Hispanic or Latino (‘Hispanic’)” (Executive Order 11246 Affirmative Action Plan, p15).

⁶ These data are taken from the most recent utilization reports provided by the ODCEI. See Tables Two and Three in the Appendix. The data are current for the fall of 2016.

⁷ These data are taken from the “NASPAA Diversity Report 2013: Over a Decade in Review,” prepared by Nicholas Primo, page 6: <https://naspaaaccreditation.files.wordpress.com/2015/02/diversity-report-10-01-13.pdf> The data are averaged over the years 2007 to 2013.

⁸ These data are taken from the Baruch College Fact Sheet: <https://www.baruch.cuny.edu/about/factsheet.htm>. This document was current in fall of 2010.

⁹ These data were provided by the US Census Bureau: <http://www.census.gov/quickfacts/table/PST045215/3651000> The data were current April 1, 2010.

¹⁰ As defined in note 5 above for MSPIA and Baruch figures, and including all non-white groups for all other figures..

In both representation of racial minorities and in gender-balance, MSPIA full time faculty is slightly worse than the college as a whole. In both areas, the MSPIA faculty is slightly better than the total full time faculty in all NASPAA accredited programs. In both areas there is a long way to go to meet the goal of having a faculty that proportionally “represent[s] the diversity of the city we serve,”¹¹ and also that of having a faculty reflective of the student body.

Recruitment

Only two searches were conducted at MSPIA in the 2015-2016 academic year, one to fill the Luciano Chair of Health Care Policy, and another to fill a Nonprofit Management Faculty line. The results of these searches illustrate the continuing difficulty of increasing the percentage of underrepresented minorities on the MSPIA faculty. Although the Luciano Chair search successfully concluded with the hiring of a woman, there were no members of other underrepresented groups in the final pool of candidates. The Nonprofit Management search generated many applicants from underrepresented groups, and an offer was made to an African American woman professor whose scholarship would have contributed to MPISA’s core work. However, she received a stronger counter-offer from her home institution.

Six new searches are moving forward in the 2016-2017 academic year at MSPIA. The Diversity Committee hopes that Search Chairs will follow best practices to give us the best possible chance of hiring talented colleagues who are members of underrepresented groups. We believe that outreach to academic associations and caucuses formed to serve the needs of underrepresented minorities is crucial. Timely advertisement of open positions as well as position announcements placed in well-known and respected sites for the academic job listings are crucial.

Retention

The years of austerity that preceded the settlement of the new PSC CUNY contract have made it difficult to retain faculty. This has hurt the gender balance of the faculty. For example, MSPIA lost 5 full time faculty members in the 2014-2015 academic year. Four of them were women, and two were lost to competitive outside offers. In the 2015-2016 academic year we also lost an Asian male junior faculty member to resignation. The record on promotion, however, has helped to maintain diversity on the faculty as one Asian woman has been promoted and tenured during this period. Both promotions to full professor in this period have been of white men.

Climate

Faculty, staff, and administrators at MSPIA work to foster a climate welcoming of diversity. Perhaps now more than ever, it is important to make clear we intend to continue our tradition of promoting an inclusive climate.

¹¹ MSPIA Diversity Strategic Plan.

MSPIA continues to host the Lillie and Nathan Ackerman Lectures, a series that intentionally offers a platform for speakers who address topics connected to social and racial justice. The most recent, given by Professor Heather Ann Thompson, concerned the 1971 Attica Prison Uprising.

Baruch has many student clubs and associations. Many represent Baruch College's own 'gorgeous mosaic' to quote former Mayor David Dinkins. Grad Pride is a recently-reestablished association of the college's LGBT students and their allies. Several of MSPIA's full-time and adjunct faculty serve as advisors to this recently-revived group. At its behest, Distinguished Lecturer Michael Seltzer will be conducting a third annual Women and LGBT history tour of Greenwich Village in the spring of 2017.

The Diversity Committee has started a [blogs@baruch](http://blogs.baruch.cuny.edu/diversefutures/) web-page to post articles and events related to diversity issues (<http://blogs.baruch.cuny.edu/diversefutures/>). Member of the MSPIA community are encouraged to send material they wish to have posted on this web-page to the Diversity Committee chair.

Many faculty members address issues related to diversity in their classes, but we recognize the need for continuous improvement around these issues. Many faculty have incorporated into their courses readings, guest speakers, case studies, videos and site visits, and research assignment topics that reflect the diversity of their students, and position their topics within a global context. In order to further encourage the exploration of these issues in the MSPIA curriculum, the Diversity Committee is working with the Schwartz Communication Institute to hold an Inclusive Pedagogy Workshop this January. In this workshop, which will be compensated, selected MSPIA faculty will work to refine their curriculum and pedagogy to stimulate and support conversations around diversity in the classroom.

Recommendations

Despite much goodwill, we must do more to promote diversity at MSPIA. What follows is a list of some of the roadblocks to achieving our diversity goals and some suggestions for overcoming them.

Networks and Advertising. A key issue is that women and racial minority faculty members are often not included in the networks normally tapped into when advertising jobs. Further, informal networks tend to be relatively homogenous. As a result, minority and women candidates may miss out on valuable information about job prospects and recruiting shared in these spaces.

Proposed Solution: Be careful to advertise widely, and to intentionally recruit across difference via special outreach in professional organizations. This is particularly important for subsections that focus on or have higher percentages of women and minority candidates (e.g., the Black Sociologists Association, the Committee on the Status of Minority Groups in the Economics Professions, or the Black Caucus of the National Communications Association). Chairs of searches for endowed professorships

are encouraged to consider applications from high-achieving assistant professor who would be promotable to associate at MSPIA, who are more likely to be members of underrepresented groups than more senior professors, and who are more likely to view our financial offers favorably than more senior professors.

Talent Pipeline and Leadership to the Field. Even when good outreach efforts are made to encourage members of underrepresented groups to apply for open positions at MSPIA, our efforts are frequently hampered by the lack of qualified members of those groups available to apply for those positions, due to systemic issues like opportunity hoarding, and homogeneity of networks.

Proposed Solution: Our committee acknowledges the importance of growing and maintaining a pipeline of academics from underrepresented groups and seeks to increase the diversity of scholars in our field. To do this, we ask that our dean as the newly elected President of NASPAA create a program to encourage, mentor, and support minorities in public affairs graduate programs. Similar programs have already been created for STEM programs (msphds.org; <https://diversifyeeb.wordpress.com/list-2/>) and business programs (phdproject.org). We would support NASPAA in creating similar programs to enhance the experience of graduate students from underrepresented groups.

CUNY Salaries and their Impact on Faculty Recruitment and Retention. The many years without a contract have made CUNY salaries uncompetitive, impeding the recruitment and hiring of minority or women candidates. In two recent searches, MSPIA made offers to excellent candidates who wanted to come to Baruch, but adherence to our salary schedule meant the offers were significantly *below* their current salaries at their home institutions. Neither accepted our offer. We also lost, on economic grounds, a prominent woman scholar who had worked happily at Baruch for nearly a decade. Baruch's response to outside offers has sometimes been slow and cumbersome, hampering efforts.

Proposed Solution: Increase funding for CUNY, to fit with its research profile. Offer more flexibility in making offers to recruit and retain targeted faculty members.

Cultural Taxation. Women and minority faculty often end up paying a "cultural tax"¹² that their white, male colleagues do not pay because of gendered and cultural expectations for university service and availability. For example, women and minority faculty often face the burden of extra demands for help from students who feel safe with them. Moreover, women and minority faculty are often asked to serve on committees where gender or racial diversity is desired. This ironic form of tokenism can also be burdensome. Such work (i.e., with students,

¹² See Amado M. Padilla, 1994. Ethnic Minority Scholars, Research, and Mentoring: Current and Future Issues. *Educational Researcher* 23 (4): 24-27. Also: Tiffany Joseph and Laura Hirshfield. 2011. Why don't you get somebody new to do it?' Race and cultural taxation in the academy. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34 (1).

on issues related to diversity) can be rewarding, but it also takes time and focus away from publishing and other career development work necessary to earn tenure.

Proposed Solution: Raise awareness of this practice, and protect minority and women faculty members' time by limiting their committee work, and putting them in touch with appropriate support services for high need services. We should also take steps to ensure that all faculty members receive credit for the time they spend mentoring, writing recommendations, and performing similar activities. We propose that MSPIA implement a simple tracking mechanism, where each semester every faculty member records how many letters of recommendation they have written, how many student groups they have advised, and how many times they have met with or engaged in lengthy email correspondence with a students or former students. These numbers can then be incorporated by the Faculty Development Coordinator into each faculty member's annual review.

Mentoring and Belonging. Many women and minority faculty may not have developed mentors early in their careers, especially if demographic realities leave them feeling alienated in their department or school. Research has consistently shown that mentors are critical to career success. This takes on heightened importance early in one's career when key decisions related to tenure and promotion such as targeting publications, focusing a research agenda, and maintaining work-life balance can be in conflict.

Proposed Solution -- Build on current positive practices: SPA should continue and deepen its current informal mentoring practices. Many senior SPA faculty, and its Faculty Director, have worked conscientiously to mentor younger colleagues. SPA's Faculty Seminar is another route for younger colleagues to get feedback on their work. And senior faculty are encouraged to mentor junior faculty through the "take a junior faculty member to lunch" program. To further advance this work, SPA could create a funded mentorship program as part of a faculty recruitment, development and retention program, especially important for women and minority faculty. This program could continue on without funding after the first several years. Where possible, mentors and mentees should be broadly matched by thematic areas of work and methods, though desire to mentor would seem most important.

Early Career Research Support. Financial support for early career faculty can help them publish their work, and seek outside funding of their own.

Proposed solution: Build on current practices. Junior faculty at SPA get certain research support, including course relief prior to tenure. Junior Faculty members should be encouraged to apply all the support that is available to them, including the Faculty Fellows Publication Program, the Lang Junior Faculty Research Fellowship, and the new Dean's Research Awards. As a best practice, we encourage the dean to offer all incoming faculty an automatic GA for the duration of their pre-tenure.

Looking Ahead

The committee will continue efforts on these projects in the coming year and welcomes ideas for projects from the faculty and student bodies in order to achieve our goals in recruitment, retention, and climate that fosters a diverse community for the Marxe School of Public and International Affairs.

Appendix: Table One, Baruch College Workforce by Equal Employment Opportunity job category, accurate as of June 18, 2015.¹³

EEO Categories	Total	Female		Minority	
	N	N	%	N	%
Executive/Administrative/Managerial (President, SVP/VP/AVP, Dean, Administrator, Associate Dean, Assistant Dean/Assistant Administrator, Computer Systems Manager, Architect, Interior Designer, Project Manager, Chief Administrative Superintendent of Buildings and Grounds, Administrative Superintendent of Buildings and Grounds, Campus Assistant Security Director, Higher Education Officer (HEO), Higher Education Associate (HEA)) ³	172	102	59.3	67	39%
Faculty (Distinguished Professor, Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, Visiting Professor, Clinical Professor, Distinguished Lecturer, Lecturer Doctoral Scholar, Lecturer, Instructor)	505	195	38.6	140	27.7
Professional/Non-Faculty (Higher Education assistant (HEa), Assistant to Higher Education Officer (aHEO), Professor (Library), Associate Professor (Library), Assistant Professor (Library), Distinguished Lecturer (Library), Finance Accountant, Purchasing Agent)	180	122	67.8	110	61.1
Secretarial/Clerical (CUNY Office/Secretarial Assistant, CUNY Administrative Assistant, Mail/Message Services Worker)	98	84	85.7	77	78.6
Technical/Paraprofessional (IT Senior Associate, IT Associate, IT Assistant, IT Support Assistant, Media Services Technician, Finance Account Assistant, College Lab Technicians (CLTs))	42	12	28.6	30	71.4

Table One Continued

EEO Categories	Total	Female		Minority	
	N	N	%	N	%
Skilled Crafts (Carpenter Supervisor, Electrician Supervisor, Painter Supervisor, Carpenter, Electrician, Painter, Elevator Mechanic, High Pressure Plant Tender, Locksmith, Thermostat Repairer, Oiler, Plumber, Steamfitter, Stationary Engineer, Maintenance Worker)	32	0	0.0	9	28.1
Service/Maintenance (Custodial Principal Supervisor, Custodial Senior Supervisor, Custodial Supervisor, Custodial Assistant, Campus Public Safety Sergeant, Campus Security Specialist, Campus Peace/Security Officer Level 2, Campus Peace/Security Officer Level 1, Stock Worker Supervisor, Stock Worker, Motor Vehicle Operator)	171	47	27.5	160	93.6
Total	1,200	562	46.8	593	49.4

¹³ Morrow, Kieran, Ocasio-Gourage, Nydia and Haynes, Danielle (2016). Executive Order 11246 Affirmative Action Plan Report. Office of Diversity, Compliance and Equity Initiatives, Baruch College. Pages 14-5.

Appendix: Table Two, Diversity Statistic fall 2016, Profesorial¹⁴

UTILIZATION ANALYSIS WORKSHEET
Two Factor Availability

College:	Baruch College
Semester/Year:	FALL, 2016

AFFIRMATIVE ACTION UNIT: PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION		CONSTITUENT DEPARTMENTS: Public Affairs					
EEO CATEGORY: PROFESSIONAL: PROFESSORIAL		Job Titles: Professor - Visiting Professor Associate Professor Assistant Professor - Clinical Professor					
JOB GROUP: PROFESSORIAL							
FACTORS:	Weighting	Females	**Total Minority	Asian or Nat. Haw. or Other Pac. Isl.	Black or African American	Hispanic or Latino	Individuals with Disabilities
1. % availability of Minorities/Females with requisite skills in immediate labor areas.	1.00	64.9	33.4	6.1	19.1	7.0	
2. % of Minorities/Females promotable, transferable, or trainable							
GROUP TOTAL NO.: <u>36</u> No. Male: <u>22</u> No. Female: <u>14</u>		Females	**Total Minority	Asian or Nat. Haw. or Other Pac. Isl.	Black or African American	Hispanic or Latino	Individuals with Disabilities
CURRENT UTILIZATION:		# <u>14</u> % <u>38.9</u>	# <u>8</u> % <u>22.2</u>	# <u>5</u> % <u>13.9</u>	# <u>2</u> % <u>5.6</u>	# <u>1</u> % <u>2.8</u>	# <u>0</u> % <u>0.0</u>
OVERALL AVAILABILITY:		% <u>64.9</u>	% <u>33.4</u>	% <u>6.1</u>	% <u>19.1</u>	% <u>7.0</u>	% <u>7.0</u>
UNDERUTILIZATION:		% <u>26.0</u> # <u>9.4</u> UU <u>9</u>	% <u>11.2</u> # <u>4.0</u> UU <u>4</u>	% <u>NONE</u> # <u>0.0</u> UU <u>0</u>	% <u>13.6</u> # <u>4.9</u> UU <u>5</u>	% <u>4.2</u> # <u>1.5</u> UU <u>2</u>	% <u>7.0</u> # <u>2.5</u> UU <u>3</u>

**Total Minority includes Asian or Nat. Haw. or Other Pac. Isl., and Am. Ind./Al. Natives, Black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, and Two or More Races.

¹⁴ Office of Diversity, Compliance and Equity Initiatives, Baruch College.

Appendix: Table Three, Diversity Statistics, fall 2016, Lecturer¹⁵

UTILIZATION ANALYSIS WORKSHEET
Two Factor Availability

College:	Baruch College
Semester/Year:	FALL, 2016

AFFIRMATIVE ACTION UNIT: PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION		CONSTITUENT DEPARTMENTS: Public Affairs 0 0					
EEO CATEGORY: PROFESSIONAL: NON-PROFESSORIAL - LECTURER		Job Titles: Lecturer					
JOB GROUP: NON-PROFESSORIAL - LECTURER							
FACTORS:	Weighting	Females	**Total Minority	Asian or Nat. Haw. or Other Pac. Isl.	Black or African American	Hispanic or Latino	Individuals with Disabilities
1. % availability of Minorities/Females with requisite skills in immediate labor areas.	1.00	82.6	43.0	3.6	23.5	13.7	
transferable, or trainable							
GROUP TOTAL NO.: <u>12</u>							
No. Male: <u>8</u>	No. Female: <u>4</u>						
CURRENT UTILIZATION:		# <u>4</u> % <u>33.3</u>	# <u>4</u> % <u>33.3</u>	# <u>2</u> % <u>16.7</u>	# <u>2</u> % <u>16.7</u>	# <u>0</u> % <u>0.0</u>	# <u>0</u> % <u>0.0</u>
OVERALL AVAILABILITY:		% <u>82.6</u>	% <u>43.0</u>	% <u>3.6</u>	% <u>23.5</u>	% <u>13.7</u>	% <u>7.0</u>
UNDERUTILIZATION:		% <u>49.2</u> # <u>5.9</u> UU <u>6</u>	% <u>9.7</u> # <u>1.2</u> UU <u>1</u>	% <u>NONE</u> # <u>0.0</u> UU <u>0</u>	% <u>6.9</u> # <u>0.8</u> UU <u>1</u>	% <u>13.7</u> # <u>1.6</u> UU <u>2</u>	% <u>7.0</u> # <u>0.8</u> UU <u>1</u>

**Total Minority includes Asian or Nat. Haw. or Other Pac. Isl., Am. Ind./Al. Natives, Black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, and Two or More Races.

¹⁵ Office of Diversity, Compliance and Equity Initiatives, Baruch College.

